

FIRE COMMISSION
City and County of San Francisco
Edwin M. Lee, Mayor

RECEIVED
BOARD OF SUPERVISORS
SAN FRANCISCO

2015 SEP -4 AM 10:17

MLC

Andrea Evans, *President*
Francee Covington, *Vice President*
Stephen A. Nakajo, *Commissioner*
Michael Hardeman, *Commissioner*
Ken Cleaveland, *Commissioner*



698 Second Street
San Francisco, CA 94107
Telephone 415.558.3451
Fax 415.558.3413
Maureen Conefrey, *Secretary*

September 1, 2015

Honorable John K. Stewart
Presiding Judge of the Superior Court
400 McAllister Street, Room 008
San Francisco, CA 94102-4512

Re: Civil Grand Jury Report
San Francisco Fire Department: What Does the Future Hold?

The Honorable John K. Stewart:

Pursuant to the request of Ms. Janice Pettey, Foreperson of the 2014-2015 Civil Grand Jury, the San Francisco Fire Commission is submitting the attached response to the Civil Grand Jury's report, dated July 13, 2015 and titled "San Francisco Fire Department: What Does the Future Hold?" Please do not hesitate to call if you have any questions or concerns regarding our response.

Thank you for your attention to this matter.

Sincerely,

Maureen Conefrey per:

ANDREA C. EVANS
President, San Francisco Fire
Commission

cc: Clerk of the Board, Government Audit and Oversight Committee
Janice Pettey, Foreperson 2014-2015 Civil Grand Jury
Fire Commissioners
Chief Joanne Hayes-White

CGJ Year	Report Title	Findings	Responding Dept.	2015 Responses (Agree/Disagree)Use the drop down menu	2015 Response Text
2014-15	San Francisco Fire Department What Does the Future Hold?	F1.1. SFFD continues to fail to meet EOA response time standards, resulting in lost revenue for the City.	SFFD Commission	disagree with it, partially (explanation in next column)	<p>The Department acknowledges that it is still a few percentage points short of the EOA standard. However, this shortfall does not directly result in lost revenue as the associated cost of additional staffing to meet the EOA standard is higher than the revenue to be gained by meeting the EOA standard.</p> <p>The Department must balance the need for increased market share with the need for minimal supply of ambulances throughout the City at all hours of the day, including the early hours of the day when the demand for ambulances is minimal.</p> <p>Since January 2015, the SFFD share of the ambulance response has been gradually increasing. The SFFD is implementing a number of measures to continue this trend:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. This year, in April, the SFFD hired a new class of 42 EMTs to increase the number of units available during peak hours. 2. Working with the Emergency Provider Data Working Group, the Department is implementing a new methodology to better match daily staffing levels with the expected ambulance demand. 3. Working with the Private Ambulance Providers, the Department is re-designing the ambulance shifts to take into consideration the private ambulance supply.
2014-15	San Francisco Fire Department What Does the Future Hold?	F1.5. SFFD has no formal strategic plan and is not creating such a plan in the near future; the Fire Commission seems a natural group to assist the Chief in this very important venture.	SFFD Commission	disagree with it, partially (explanation in next column)	<p>At the urging of the Fire Commission, the Fire Department has embarked on a strategic planning process. The planning began in the spring of 2015 with meetings with the President of Local 798, outside consultants who specialize in strategic planning, and a former Chief of the Oakland Fire Department. Following these meetings, the Chief and President of Local 798 formed a Steering Committee that includes members from each rank in the Department, President of the Fire Commission, and individuals from outside of the Department, thus creating a Committee with a breadth of experience and expertise. The Steering Committee held a kick off meeting on July 21, 2015. The Department retained an outside consultant to facilitate the kick-off meeting. The Committee anticipates completion of the strategic plan in the spring of 2016.</p>
2014-15	San Francisco Fire Department What Does the Future Hold?	F2.3. Most fire departments in the region do not have training facilities comparable to the TI training center (or the new SFFD training center that would replace it). Some of these agencies use the TITC for training and would likely continue use if it remains available, even if the fee structure was converted to include revenue for SFFD and the City.	SFFD Commission	agree with finding	

CGJ Year	Report Title	Recommendations	Responding Dept.	2015 Responses (implementation) Use the drop down menu	2015 Response Text
2014-15	San Francisco Fire Department What Does the Future Hold?	R1.1. That by December 2015 the Chief develop a plan and the methodology for bringing response times for both Code 2 and Code 3 calls to required levels, and that the Department achieve compliance with EOA standards by December 2016.	SFFD Commission	The recommendation has been implemented (summary of how it was implemented in next column)	The development of a plan and methodology was formalized in the fall of 2014 with the formation of the City's ambulance work group, headed by the Mayor's Office with representatives from SFFD, DEM, Controller, Board of Supervisors, Fire Commission and other relevant stakeholders. This work group and its various sub groups were responsible for analyzing the issues facing the City's EMS system and developing recommendations to meet both response and EOA metrics for both the SFFD and private providers. A number of these recommendations have been implemented, including additional staffing for the Department, the purchase of new ambulances, and the staffing of a nurse at a DPH shelter. In addition, a number of recommendations have been funded in the new FY15-16 budget or are currently being implemented, such as restoration of the HOME team, per diem employees and other initiatives. There is on-going analysis done to staffing levels, work load, and call volume to regularly monitor the performance of the system, and all invested providers meet regularly to discuss issues and topics of relevance.
2014-15	San Francisco Fire Department What Does the Future Hold?	R1.1.1 .The Fire Commission should require the Chief to prepare a monthly report on ambulance performance versus the EOA and the average number of ambulances capable of responding to a service call.	SFFD Commission	The recommendation has been implemented (summary of how it was implemented in next column)	Even before the civil grand jury report was issued, the Fire Commission had tasked the Chief to report on ambulance response times and progress toward meeting the EOA. These reports are typically provided by the Deputy Chief of Operations. The Commission has been actively monitoring these issues for years.
2014-15	San Francisco Fire Department What Does the Future Hold?	R1.5. That by December 2015 the Chief, using funds allocated in the next budget year, contract with an experienced consultant to initiate a strategic plan covering: full funding for equipment renewal; facilities maintenance and updates; communication technology; and training for both normal operations and disasters	SFFD Commission	The recommendation has not been, but will be, implemented in the future (timeframe for implementation noted in next column)	The issue of strategic planning has been a priority for the Department, but its development and implementation had been hampered by the lack of fiscal resources. In the new fiscal year's budget, the Department was allocated additional personnel to enhance the Department's planning capabilities. The Chief has recently formed the Department's Strategic Planning Committee, and this committee had its initial kick-off meeting in July and follow-up meetings with stakeholder groups are occurring. However, the caveat is that, even with a thorough and robust strategic plan, there is no guarantee that funding will be available to fully support the plan. This is an issue that the Department has been struggling with in the past (such as with the Department's existing vehicle replacement plan) and will continue to do so in the future, even with the improved economic conditions.
2014-15	San Francisco Fire Department What Does the Future Hold?	R2.3 That while Recommendations 2.1 and 2.2 are being explored, the Chief and the Fire Commission determine an alternate site for the training center since, if an already City-owned site is not adequate to serve as a training center, purchase of a new site will be more than difficult in the current real estate market.	SFFD Commission	The recommendation has not been, but will be, implemented in the future (timeframe for implementation noted in next column)	The Commission agrees that It is important for the Department to retain a first-class training facility. The Commission has been assured that the Department has reviewed the agreement with TIDA. Further, the Commission is aware that the Department would like to retain the location of its training facility on Treasure Island, but it does not have the authority to require TIDA to amend the agreement. The Department has advised the Commission that it is unlikely that TIDA will take any steps to remove or dismantle the existing training facility within the next seven years, at the earliest. Nevertheless, the Department has already advised the City's Capital Planning Committee that an alternate site might be necessary in the event that TIDA proposes another use for the current training site. The Commission will monitor TIDA's plans as they develop.